Europe @ Home
European Civic Education through the mobile

Digital Education Tools: Opportunities vs Practice
EUROPE@HOME: European Civic Education Through the Mobile

Digital Education tools: Opportunities vs Practice

Project funded by the Erasmus + Programme of the European Union, under the key action 2: Cooperation for innovation and the exchange of good practices.
Acknowledgments: We would like to thank all the organisations and individuals that helped and contributed with their input to the creation of this publication. We would also like to acknowledge the support and feedback for the creation of this document from the side of Carmen B. Romero.

Project Funded by:
The Nationale Agentur Erasmus+ JUGEND IN AKTION

This publication was developed under the project “Europe@Home – European Civic Education through the mobile”, funded with the support from the European Commission through the Erasmus+ Programme. This publication reflects only the authors’ views. The Nationale Agentur Erasmus+ JUGEND IN AKTION and the European Commission are not responsible for any use that may be made of the information it contains.
Abstract of Output 1

Project Summary

Prologue

Methodological approach
  MILESTONES

Digitalisation trends in online learning environments
  TOP TRENDS ON DIGITAL EDUCATION
  INNOVATIVE APPROACHES TO ONLINE LEARNING
  STRATEGIES FOR DIGITAL LEARNING:
  TOP TENDS ON ONLINE LEARNING TOOLS
  THE ROLE OF THE LEARNER
  THE DIGITAL DIVIDE: INFRASTRUCTURE
  THE DIGITAL DIVIDE: DIGITAL COMPETENCES

What to consider when creating and implementing an effective approach to digital learning?
  INCLUSION
  CREATING ENGAGEMENT
  COMMUNITY BUILDING
  DIGITAL SAFE SPACE
  QUALITY ASSURANCE
  DIGITAL LEARNING APPLICATION ON THE TOPIC OF CIVIC AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

BRINGING THE HUMAN FACTOR INTO THE DIGITAL ENVIRONMENT

Annex

RESOURCES LIST

ICT TOOL LIST

ICT AND COVID-19 SUMMARY STATUS FROM THE EDUCATION AND TRAINING MONITOR 2020

BELGIUM: Education and Training Monitor 2020

BULGARIA: Education and Training Monitor 2020

FRANCE: Education and Training Monitor 2020

GERMANY: Education and Training Monitor 2020

MALTA: Education and Training Monitor
  SURVEY REPORT
  BIBLIOGRAPHY
Abstract of Output 1

In the scope of the project "Europe@Home: European Civic Education through the Mobile", the current document presents the results of an extensive reflection about digital learning, with a particular focus on youth organisations, inevitably impacted by the Covid-19 pandemic.

The reflection developed in the Output 1 is based on state-of-the-art research, which provided a theoretical framework, plus findings collected from 33 youth organisations in over 10 different countries in Europe.

Output 1 will take the reader through a journey that aims to elucidate the critical points in the design, implementation and evaluation of digital learning activities or more sophisticated protocols, with a particular focus on how digital methodologies, approaches to learning and tools can be applied in the area of European Civic Education.

Project Summary

The years of 2020 and 2021 have been disrupted by the Covid-19 pandemic which has affected many areas of people's lives and moved many professional and civic activities to the online sphere. Building on the Europe@School programme, the 18-months project "Europe@Home: European Civic Education through the mobile" aims to examine and further develop the practices of digital education that were put in place in the wake of the pandemic, with a particular focus on European Civic Education.

Through desk research and innovative online and offline activities, the partnership will take JEF Europe twenty-year-old Europe@School programme to a new level by going digital and cooperating with different youth organisations to discover the best practices in digital education of recent years and their successful deployments throughout the Covid-19 pandemic.

In addition, the partnership will develop the digital competences and skills of its members, educators, as well as those of representatives of other organisations in order to enable work with digitally adapted tools, thus contributing to the integration of digital elements in the educational and pedagogical trajectories of the future.
Prologue

Digital education has gained a fast growing importance, especially in the way different stakeholders create and make educational content available to their audiences. A proliferation of courses and educational programmes has been galvanized by a very dynamic technological landscape, which offers a constant stream of innovative tools for content creation and dissemination.

Even though this process has been ongoing for a few decades, we believe that online learning is now a subject of particular relevance, due to the constraints on face-to-face education imposed by the Covid-19 pandemic crisis.

The worldwide experience of lockdown has promoted a more generalised and accelerated shift towards virtual solutions, in many domains of life such as education, work, access to public and private services, entertainment, and social interaction. In the context of the youth sector, digital learning has been implemented for a long time by different stakeholders, in a variety of learning protocols, due to its intrinsic benefits. It also showed immense inaptitude from public bodies (eg. schools) to provide technological and methodical sound adaptations for broad scale online learning.

The experience of lockdown and socially restrictive measures in place as a result of the Covid-19 sanitary crisis have imposed a generalised need to rethink in-person activities, which has contributed to the massive diffusion of digital strategies to bridge the physical divide.

The youth organisations represented in this consortium are convinced that given the strategic relevance of digital learning, it is crucial to promote further research based on the methods, approaches, practices and tools that have been applied in the field, in order to identify the best practices and potential pitfalls through theoretical and empirical analysis.

The result of the research, analysis and reflection after the inputs of several stakeholders with direct intervention in the field of online education will inform the creation of a manual for the development of efficient and innovative online learning instruments.
Methodological approach

In order to better understand how digital learning is elaborated and presented to the youth public we designed a tripod approach, which integrates state-of-the-art-research, a survey targeting youth organisations with online learning experience and a reflection board where the partners gathered ideas, impressions and experiences about online learning. Insights on each stage of the data collection and analysis process are detailed below.

MILESTONES

- Research

For the research, we aimed at mapping innovative teaching and learning technologies and open educational resources aligned with the European policy framework. We also extended the research into areas such as civic and citizenship education, so as to better integrate the digital learning methodologies and practices with the specificities of content related to the field of civic and citizenship education.

- Survey

We aimed for an empirical characterisation of the practices, approaches and overall strategies developed by youth organisations in their efforts to create digital learning instruments. Digital learning instruments here refers to a vast category of online options that can encompass a single activity, such as a webinar on a specific topic or an online course, which may include several digital learning components put together as a protocol. To illustrate what a protocol may look like in practical terms it is useful to think of a live training session with a facilitator, followed by independent work done through a set of media content (for instance a MOOC or Podcast).

As youth organisations aiming to better understand digital learning and promote innovation within our own structures, we felt compelled to establish our target group within our organisational peers, who have implemented several types of online learning approach directed to a youth audience. The survey was developed according to a thematic structure, oriented by the following analytical variables:

- The general description of the online learning approach, in order to determine the merits and motivations behind the initiative.
- The digital infrastructure used, which allowed us to explore the criteria behind the selection of a given digital tool or online platform over another.
- The role of a target group in determining the digital protocol in place.
- Online safety and data protection, with a particular focus on the youth public.
- The impact of the Covid-19 health crisis in the development or implementation of the digital learning activity or protocol.
- Online engagement opportunities of the digital approach.
• The limitations and shortcomings in implementing online activities/programs, and the ways in which these can be mitigated.
• A second set of questions related to civic/citizenship education was made available for organisations that engaged in online initiatives on the topic, so that we could further observe the particularities of civic/citizenship education in online settings.

The survey was available throughout the month of February 2021 and was disseminated by the consortium within their respective youth organisational networks, both local and at European level. The call for participation has reached the member organisations of each one of the Partners in the consortium, local universities, and European youth umbrella organisations, both by targeted emails and social media campaigns. In the table below, we summarize the dissemination approach among our data collection universe and the participation that later informed our analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISSEMINATION APPROACH (Local, National and EU level)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEMBER ORGANISATIONS (MO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- JEF Europe: 27 MO’s / 27 Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- OBESSU: 32 MO’s / 24 Countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- EUROPEAN STUDENT’S UNION: 41 MO’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUROPEAN UMBRELLA ORGANISATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- LIFELONG LEARNING PLATFORM: 41 MO’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- EUROPEAN YOUTH FORUM: Over 100 MO’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCAL / NATIONAL EDUCATION PROVIDERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- NGO’S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- UNIVERSITIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU NETWORKS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The consortium targeted partner organisations from other projects and assorted youth collectives from within our networks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SURVEY PARTICIPATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- 32 NGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 1 UNIVERSITY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- FROM 11 DIFFERENT COUNTRIES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Survey dissemination and participation.

❖ Intellectual output

In the last two sections we have outlined the data collection process in place. Now we will focus our attention on the analysis of the data collected and how these were operationalized in order
to create an intellectual output which will support the development of a manual on digital learning (classified in the project application as Intellectual Output 2).

After processing the theoretical inputs from the literature on digital learning and the empirical data that emerged from the survey, a limited set of thematic considerations proved to be more relevant and frequent than others.

Throughout the months of February and March (2021), we developed a shared reflection composed of five main topics with identifiable structural significance, in order to better understand the potential and limitations of online learning. The reflection board is a space where multiple stakeholders were invited to comment, edit and brainstorm on how those main topics can be addressed to create digital learning activities or programs that are efficiently designed.

The merits of a quality online learning output are evaluated both in terms of the learning goals set by the youth sector organisations and the needs and expectations of the public.

Our main aim was to gather and process information that can be operationalised in very concrete and practical ways. Our success is demonstrated by the way the elements of the partnership interacted with the reflection board; by the very operational outlook adopted while working each thematic session which sought to find the most appropriate tools, methods and approaches for several possible scenarios.

Throughout interaction with the content, we were able to test the relevance of the topics highlighted by the research and survey as critical for the development of online learning tools.

The structure of our analysis stands on five main topics. These are individually debated, in order to find the sub-categories of problems or limitations that need to be addressed. Debate is followed by the strategies and tools that can be applied in the specific situations to mitigate initial issues. The procedure is illustrated in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Community building</th>
<th>Engagement</th>
<th>Online safety</th>
<th>Innovation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sub-topic (could be a common problem or a limitation)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategies (to address it)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Thematic structure of the analysis.
In the next section, we will dive deeper into the specifics of digital education, with a particular focus on the characterisation of the digitalisation movement and the impact of the Covid-19 health crisis in the online environment. After that, we will take a more empirical road and further discuss how we can align the data inputs collected with the design and implementation of efficient online learning protocols for young audiences.

Digitalisation trends in online learning environments

The digitalisation movement applied to education and lifelong learning has been a reality in expansion, accelerated by the Covid-19 health crisis, in which all sorts of organisations (public, private, for profit or NGOs) had to abruptly adapt the daily activities, in order to reach out and provide services to citizens, students and professionals.

Long before the Covid-19 pandemic, digitalisation of education has been a trend propelled by the fast technological advances and the demands of the structural changes in labour markets, which require flexible professionals with lifelong learning competences.

At this point, the relevance of digital education in the youth sector is undeniable, due to its intrinsic potential to foster learning in a very effective way. We will focus our reflection on what variables can contribute to effective digital learning protocols, by listing the main trends observed when it comes to online education, the top trends related to the learning strategies and the favourite tools applied.

TOP TRENDS ON DIGITAL EDUCATION

Listed below are the main trends on education according to the Commission SW document *Analysis and mapping of innovative teaching and learning for all through new Technologies and Open Educational Resources in Europe*, namely:

- **Personalisation**: can be achieved through “...individual learning plans and tailor-made learning activities. A mix of different technologies can support personalisation, by allowing for a diversity of learning activities, tools and materials; providing tools which support continuous monitoring and assessment strategies; making educational resources openly available; allowing for the implementation of collaborative projects; offering learning opportunities that are motivating, engaging and even playful; and supporting multilingual environments”.

Collaboration: can be fostered by cross-discipline and project-based activities that contribute to the community at large, where learners cooperate in a pool of diversity (cultural, social and age groups). “Virtual study exchange programmes, internet based intercultural exchange projects, online massive multiplayer games, simulations creating and sharing open educational resources with peers and other internet-based services can serve educational institutions in allowing learners to experience, understand and reflect upon societal developments in a safe and protected environment”.

Blended learning: can be promoted within the scope of formal and informal learning opportunities with a focus on converting personal or professional experiences into skills and competences that are relevant for an individual at each life stage. (2013: SWD. 341 final, page 7).

Recommendations:

Some useful approaches as you design, implement and evaluate a digital learning protocol:

1. Learning occurs in many different ways. Promoting a variety of learning styles means making sure all learners can engage with content according to their preferences.
2. People arrive at a digital learning environment with different skill levels. A more personalised approach to learning allows participants to engage with all or some of the content at their own pace.
3. Consider having additional materials for inexperienced learners, so that they can find additional resources in case they need more contextualisation or general support than others.
4. Consider having additional materials for advanced learners, in case they wish to deepen their knowledge and explore by themselves.
5. Create activities that support the participants in the development of their own projects, so that the knowledge gained can be put into practice in a way that adds value to their personal experiences.
6. Digital learning does not have to be individual work. It should include opportunities for collaboration. Different people working together adds value to the overall process and results of the project. As we will further demonstrate below, a variety of skills can be practiced and acquired when people from different backgrounds collaborate.
INNOVATIVE APPROACHES TO ONLINE LEARNING

Continuing to explore the main trends related to the digital learning outlook, we now move from education trends to the instrumental aspect of learning, by listing innovative approaches that have been applied in digital learning, according to the same source, namely:

- **Rhizomatic Learning**: can be achieved by promoting learning opportunities that occur “through multi-facets/avenues of inquiry, taking contexts and previous knowledge and experiences into consideration, using social and personal sources of learning to foster a personal learning network”.

- **Assessment for Learning**: requires a shift of focus from assessment (evaluation) to an assessment of learning. Instead of grades, the output is feedback aimed at enhancing individualised learning and thus developing a better learner.

- **Seamless Learning**: learning across multiple locations, platforms and formats in a continuous way.

- **Learning Analytics**: an emphasis on obtaining data on the learner and their context so as to improve learning opportunities.

- **Personal Inquiry Learning**: focus on the learner as an active and exploratory learning agent involved in the discovery and inquiry of learning processes. This approach to learning is related to personalisation, the first trend in education listed above. (2013: SWD. 341 final, page 6)

**Recommendations:**

Some useful approaches when designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol:

1. Create moments where the learner is invited to reflect on how the knowledge and skills in questions can be applied in their personal life.
2. Investment in informal moments will pay off, as learners can benefit from sharing personal experiences.

3. Use quizzes and polls so that the participants can share their likes and dislikes.

4. Remember that personal sharing is voluntary and no one should feel pressured to participate in any way.

5. Bring a variety of tools and activities to keep the learning experience fresh, while allowing the participants to practice new skills sets.

6. Analysis and evaluation do not have to be localized at the end of the program. A Mentimeter (here) or a targeted survey may provide information about the participants, in order to better shape the learning experience ahead.

7. Using gamification and role play in the learning process can provide important insights about the profiles of participants, their personalities and learning styles.

8. Empower the learner to take center stage in the learning experience, by promoting active participation and interaction with the content. The learner may reflect about the competences and skills he/she is looking forward to developing, and if possible, adapt the learning experience to cater to individual needs, interests and expectations.

STRATEGIES FOR DIGITAL LEARNING:

- **Fully virtual learning:** strategy where content is made available as e-books, articles (Wordpress/blogs), videos (Youtube, Instagram/MOOC format) or podcasts, and the participants are encouraged to have a direct interaction with it. This strategy requires more investment in the content creation process, but once it is concluded, dissemination takes place. If the content stays the same throughout, the dissemination protocol will provide visibility so that more and more public is granted an opportunity to interact with this digital learning experience. A protocol of multiple digital tools can be combined to appeal to different learning preferences or needs, for instance linking videos to articles (or vice versa). Free digital learning content in these formats can be monetised and perhaps yield small financial returns. This strategy tends to provide more autonomy and control to the learner, as they may have the power to navigate through the content as they see fit. The designer of the digital learning protocol can always best advise on how to interact with the content, and even release new content in a sequential order.

- **Mediated digital learning:** more frequent since the Covid-19 pandemic due to the need to swiftly transform in-person training into online learning, mediated digital learning includes the notorious virtual meetings on platforms allowing interaction between participants and a facilitator/trainer. This learning strategy requires one mediator to support the participants in the learning journey. Typically, the sessions or activities are scheduled so
that the facilitator and participants can meet in a virtual meeting room at the same time. Activity-based learning can be often split into a number of sessions, as a contingency of the screen fatigue caused by virtual settings. The formula is similar to in-person activity learning: one or more facilitator(s) or trainer(s), an audience, the whiteboard. Each participant has a camera, a microphone, icons for reactions and a chat box. According to the results of our survey, this was by far the most popular mitigation plan applied during the first year of the Covid-19 pandemic.

- **Mixed protocol**: generates digital learning outputs integrating both strategies (fully digital and mediated). These protocols tend to combine multiple approaches and tools to allow variety in the ways learners interact with the content. The protocol may include training sessions or webinars with live presentation from one facilitator or trainer and access to virtual content like videos, e-books, podcasts or a MOOC for an independent learning path. The data gathered by our survey reveals that this is a growing strategy within youth organisations.

The characterization of strategies for digital learning is a result of the data gathered by survey application. These were the 3 main approaches, according to the following criteria: type of interaction of the participants with the content (direct / mediated by a trainer or facilitator) and the use of digital tools (same format like a training for instance / combination of tools).

**TOP TRENDS ON ONLINE LEARNING TOOLS**

Here we list the most used online learning tools, so as to explore how these relate to the expectations and approaches applied to digital learning. Our data (survey output) suggests that a more comprehensive list of tools should be considered, as the digital learning makeup is not a standard model that fits all learners. On the contrary, it requires the ability to mobilise resources for an experience which is both individualised and interactive.

Below are the online learning tools featured in current trends:

- **Online articles**: posted in a blog or website (the most common being Wordpress). When many articles present internal coherence, it may be possible to compile them in an e-book format.

- **E-book**: with innovative and interactive formats.

- **Videos**: posted on platforms such as Youtube and Instagram, videos can be made available with transcripts as comprehensive as any article (which can be posted in a
separate reading platform). When many videos present internal coherence, it may be possible to edit them into a course.

- **Podcasts**: popular episodic audio files, these can also contain transcripts with links to related resources. This is a particularly flexible tool, since it can be consumed online (streaming) or downloaded for offline use.

- **MOOC**: stands for Massive Open Online Courses. MOOCs can be structured in two different ways: either the learner has the flexibility to interact with the content at their own pace, selecting what appeals more to their interest, or each module is released according to a schedule that standardises the interaction between learner and content.

- **Open courseware (OCW)**: broad strategy to present an integrated set of different materials for one whole course. The protocols vary, but OCW might include a syllabus, online training sessions (video, audio, presentations...), exercises, exams or assessment of learning outcomes. “OpenCourseWare” are free and openly licensed online courses, made available via the internet (Higher Education institutions have been instrumental in adding a large variety of courses in platforms that aggregate an extensive portfolio, for example Coursera).

Even though digital learning is unequivocally a tool for lifelong learning, the digitalisation movement also faces challenges that can impact the otherwise broad reach and access of online learning protocols. Exploring the limitations faced in the digital transition can help uncover ways to mitigate their impact on the learning experience.

This will be our next focal point, as beyond the challenges, we look for empirical inputs on how those shortcomings have been addressed, and most importantly what are the main areas we need to take into consideration when designing an effective digital learning activity or programme.

**THE ROLE OF THE LEARNER**

The learner is at the center of the learning process. The needs, preferences and characteristics of the participants in a given learning process can be evaluated and considered from the earliest stages of the digital learning planning. Youth organisations tend to know their target audience, however it is advised to actively consult potential participants to better understand their expectations, resources and digital competences at the early stages of planning.

The learner assumes an active role in the creation of the learning process and can be even involved in decision-making processes related to the learning content, tasks and participation in activities. This approach of autonomy and active participation allows the learner to acquire knowledge and skills due to their exposure to participatory methods in learning, instead of
passive approaches to knowledge transfer (from the vehicle holding the knowledge to the passive receptor).

A paradigm shift in digital education towards the empowerment of the learner as the central figure in its own path to self-development requires some specific characteristics in order to foster lifelong autonomy for skill development. Below are the topics which should be considered when developing and implementing digital learning methodologies:

- **Get to know your prospective learners**: a heterogeneous group will have individuals with different resources, needs and competences levels. Additional information may allow the development of learning strategies to cater for personalised interaction with the learning content.

- **Different learners learn in different ways**: when applicable, it is advised to offer a varied range of learning approaches and support systems to cover different learning styles.

- **Social learning environments**: group learning promotes the development of skills and attitudes socially constructed, alongside knowledge and core skills.

- **Safe space**: impactful learning requires a space where the wellbeing of educators and learners is fostered and respected as a must-have.

- **Collaborative work**: an essential contribution for social skills which can be applied to team work.

- **Problem-solving mindset**: digital activities can include exercises incentivising the learners to troubleshoot and course-correct.

- **Project-based learning**: an ingenious way to promote learning opportunities that allow the learner(s) to work on a topic of interest and develop it within a multidisciplinary framework. This approach fosters autonomy and the development of a large array of skills due to its cyclical process of identification of a problem or topic, research, mobilisation of different points of views, the establishment of a narrative to make sense of the topic or a strategy to solve the problem.
- **Game-based learning or learning through gamification:** approach to learning that can be very motivating and experiential for the learner, as it calls for a very active participation of the learner(s). The goal is to convey knowledge in a way that incentivises interaction through reward. Small tasks/challenges will provide rewards to propel the learner to keep moving towards the next reward. For a practical example, this learning strategy can be seen in language learning apps (Duolingo).

- **Experiential learning:** focuses on the process, not the end goal of acquiring theoretical knowledge. Learner(s) are exposed to situations in which they will have to take action, make decisions and solve dilemmas that will result in personal growth/awareness and development of transferable skills which can then be applied in other fields of life or new situations.

The topics referred are the result of data inputs from the survey and research, based on a policy document called proposal for a council recommendation on Key Competences for lifelong learning. SWD (2018:14), pages 75-78.

Placing the learner at the center of the learning experience is a step towards a more holistic vision of personhood, its needs and challenges within society. The knowledge transfer paradigm in a theoretical context tends to be replaced by a situational (real life) learning opportunity, which takes the learner through a journey calling for innovative solutions, creativity, problem-solving and analytical skills, all transferable skills that will be valuable as citizens navigating today’s world.

**THE DIGITAL DIVIDE: INFRASTRUCTURE**

For what concerns the structural aspects of digital infrastructure, there is still a long way to go in order to achieve even homogenous availability of ICT (Information and Communication Technology) infrastructure, tools and connectivity across Europe. Some parts of the public sector have increasingly been shifting the access to services towards digital apparatus (we can access services like social security online).

Nevertheless, the Covid-19 pandemic has shown that most educational systems were not ready to resume digital learning when abrupt lockdowns were put in place. This situation stresses that open and innovative learning through digital media is negatively impacted by the uneven distribution of ICT equipment.
This is particularly important when designing a digital learning outlook, as we need to consider if our audience has the infrastructure required to interact with the digital content (digital equipment such as hardware and software, or internet connection). Besides the structural public infrastructure, social conditions may influence the access to equipment and connectivity. The lack of access to ICT tools due to poor infrastructure or as a result of restrictive social frameworks can have a negative impact in reinforcing the digital divide, since it stimulates a gap between those in a position that allows online learning and the others who lack the means to engage with digital education and therefore are deprived of the opportunity to develop the skills and competences offered to the former. What this means practically is that when designing a methodology for digital learning, we need to take into consideration the tools and technical requirements needed to grant wider access to digital platforms.

We need to be diligent in order to gather information about the technical requirements of each digital learning activity and verify if our target public has the resources to match it. Listed below are the main aspects to take into account, from the point of view of our audience:

- What equipment is required (computer, smartphone).
- Compatibility to mainstream software or apps.
- Internet usage required.

The digital divide is not only a result of the uneven distribution of ICT infrastructure amongst countries, regions and individuals, but also a consequence of the variability of digital competences among age groups, education levels and gender.

In the next section, we will focus on the importance of the digital skill level required to access and interact with digital education, and what steps can be taken to ensure our digital learning programs are as inclusive as possible.

THE DIGITAL DIVIDE: DIGITAL COMPETENCES

The fact that today’s young learners are digital natives does not necessarily attest to their digital competences. The idea that young people effortlessly operate web-based tools is representative of only a fraction of the youth population. Data from OECD and PISA (2009) demonstrate that digital literacy is still an issue, as many students struggle with digital reading. This suggests that the use of digital platforms for leisure does not necessarily convey the same digital proficiency as ICT-based activities related to educational work (at school or at home). (2013: SWD. 341 final, page 20).
Youth organisations can positively contribute to mitigating the digital divide by creating digital programs that offer a wide set of technological possibilities to access online learning, while developing digital skills as a collateral effect of the interaction with the digital learning activities. Thus it is essential to clarify what are the digital competences involved in a certain activity, and actively seek strategies to integrate opportunities for skills acquisition in the methodologies sustaining digital learning protocols.

- **Digital foundation**: being able to use digital tools like an internet browser, connecting to the internet, keeping passwords secure, moving a file or zipping documents.
- **Communication**: the ability to send emails, use attachments and participate in social media.
- **Handling information and content**: using search engines, being aware that not all online content is reliable, accessing content across devices.
- **Problem solving**: the ability to find solutions to problems by using FAQs, tutorials and browsing chat rooms.
- **Being safe and legal**: the knowledge of the best practices in data storage, updating and keeping passwords secure and taking precautions against viruses, including actively taking precautions on self protection and privacy online.

The [Education and Training Monitor website](#) provides further information about the infrastructure distribution, individualised access to digital resources and competences among other indicators in each EU member state. The 2020 report is extensive, but we focus on the data available for Belgium, Bulgaria, France, Germany and Malta in relation to the following indicators:

- **Digital education**: both ICT infrastructure and ICT competences level.
- **Covid-19**: Description of the affairs.

A summary status, based on the Education and Training Monitor for each of the referred countries may be found in the Annex section.

So far we have been characterising digital learning in its preferential methods and approaches in order to promote a learning experience that places the learner in the center of all, as a lifelong contributor for self development. An assessment of the constraints imposed by ICT infrastructure and competences was essential for understanding the structural pitfalls which we navigate everyday as proponents of digital learning protocols for the youth sector. A clear outline of the structural limitation is needed, even though we acknowledge our limited range of action in this sphere. For this reason, our reflection will now move towards the significant areas impacting the quality of digital learning which happen to be actionable, and therefore fit to be included in our best practices. We will take a more practical approach aimed at providing tips on how to design, implement and evaluate digital learning, and insights on how to source and apply inputs from our data research.
The five main topics selected from our state-of-the-art research, survey and internal reflection are:

- Inclusion
- Community building
- Engagement
- Digital safe space
- Quality assurance

Those topics will not exhaust all there is to know about digital learning methodologies applied to civic and citizenship education, but our data driven analysis has pointed the reflection towards the relevance of designing digital learning protocols that are inclusive, that support participants, that promote engagement, that are safe and that can be evaluated for improvement.

**What to consider when creating and implementing an effective approach to digital learning?**

A detailed reflection of each of the items above will follow, through which we will approach operationalisation throughout all stages of the development process of a given digital learning activity or protocol. To clarify, the digital learning development process occurs as follows:

1. **Design of the digital learning activity or protocol:** initial stage of the process, when the goals of the digital learning initiative are defined as well as the digital approach, the tools, the learning methodology, the audience, the dissemination and recruitment of the participants.
2. **Application of the digital learning activity or protocol:** when the implementation of the learning methodology and digital learning strategy are ready to be put in place.
3. **Follow up of the digital learning activity or protocol:** this phase occurs after the implementation and focuses on the evaluation of the previous stages of the process by all stakeholders involved (the youth organization(s), the trainers or facilitators, if applicable, and the participants). Executing quality control allows concrete analysis for improvement. This phase also includes the validation or certification of competences acquired by the participants.
INCLUSION

The world is diverse and education faces many challenges related to environmental, institutional and attitudinal barriers, which can either be reinforced or mitigated in the digital sphere. Youth organisations proponents of digital learning can positively contribute to a full and equal access to knowledge and competences for a larger slice of the youth population by taking into account the intrinsic diversity of their audience, and providing tools aligned with their characteristics.

This primordial aim for inclusion should be considered from the very first stage of the development of the project so that the budget can account for additional tools and actions that better serve a diverse audience.

Our approach is to list the barriers experienced by individuals with lack of access to technical items, lack of representation (social, cultural, ethnic, linguistic) and/or sensory impairments. To each barrier we will point out and elicit the safeguards and recommendations for an inclusive digital learning experience.

Technical Barriers: describe the total or partial lack of accessibility when it comes to hardware tools or internet connectivity.

- Hardware equipment: refers to the access to personal laptop, home PC or a personal smartphone.
- Computer Software: compatibility with the most common computer programs (Microsoft Windows /Mac/Linux)
- Mobile software: compatibility with the most common mobile programs (Apple iOS /Google android/Windows phone OS)
- Memory usage: in case downloads are required (applications, programs, tools or files) it is important to consider the memory usage required, from the point of view of a domestic user.
- Internet connection: internet availability should be considered, as some regional or social factors may dictate low connectivity access.
- Digital competences: participants may have different levels of digital competences, therefore it is critical to select a digital apparatus that is simple to use, preferably selecting digital platforms already familiar to our audience.
Recommendation:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that:

1. Digital learning can be accessed by a computer or a smartphone. This can occur for many reasons, including personal preferences. Remember this and test if training sessions, webinars, videos, podcasts, e-books and other learning tools can be accessed by both computer and smartphone.

2. Online connection will be the main ingredient in any online activity. Spotty connection or no connection can be detrimental to the execution of an online activity. Always make sure that the technical tools used allow for regular internet usage, avoiding usage overload (by asking the participants to navigate in multiple browsers, or doing several operations in different programs or applications).

3. To mitigate online issues, consider making some key activities available by phone. For that, the organisation should be able to pay for the charges, so be sure to budget accordingly and verify the participants may benefit from this, and inform them on how to claim the charges.

4. In online activities with a facilitator, it is advised to have a second person to provide support, in case technical issues may occur. This way the facilitator can proceed, while the 2nd element in the team can provide technical support to the participants experiencing technical difficulties or further clarification in case they are not familiar with the digital platform in use. Also, if feasible, the facilitator and the technical support should be located in different places, just in case the connection is interrupted and both are unable to resume the online session.

5. When participants register for a digital learning activity (online or offline) provide materials for technical support (how to guide sent in advance with screenshots, or video explaining how to navigate the platform), so that they can be ready to fully participate in the activities.

6. Explore if a digital learning session online can be complemented or duplicated in other versions, so that it may be downloaded and accessed at the participants’ convenience. Downloading an e-book, a podcast or videos will allow access to the learning content, independently from immediate internet connectivity.

7. Select a technical apparatus of digital platforms and instruments that speak the language of the participants. Using familiar tools can eliminate entry barriers.

8. Select technical infrastructure compatible with screen readers. Screen readers are a type of assistive technology that renders text and image content as speech or braille output. These apps can also support illiterate individuals or people with learning disabilities.
Sensory impairment: this sub-topic is related to three types of impairment to the senses (there are more, but not extremely significant in digital context). No matter the severity of the impairment, we should aim for viable alternatives for speech impediment, sight or hearing impairment.

Recommendations:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that:

1. Co-creation and collaboration are essential for an inclusive environment. At the creation stage of the project, look around and notice who is excluded from the digital learning opportunity you are creating, actively look for participants who could have been excluded and invite them to collaborate. Partner organisations specialised in physical issues related to inclusion can also be great contributors for a more diverse and rich learning environment. This is guaranteed to expand your network both in terms of young individuals and partner organisations.

2. Conduct a needs assessment prior to each activity in order to identify if there are particular needs amongst your member organisations/individual members which are not being addressed. Knowledge is power!

3. Create a safe space for disclosure, but keep in mind that disclosure of personal information is a choice (protected by law). The fear of discrimination and stigmatisation can contribute to a culture of silence around disability. A safe space should be welcoming, open and encouraging, so that participants willing to disclose any type of sensory impairment can find structural support according to their needs.

4. When designing your next digital learning protocol with image (videos or online training sessions) budget for captions. Captions should be the standard, not just an alternative.

5. When designing your next digital learning protocol with images (videos or online training sessions), budget for sign language interpreting, or look within your network if you can find an ASL translator willing to help.

6. When implementing an online activity, remember that verbal participation should be voluntary and always allow people to participate by writing (invite participants to use the public chat for that purpose or to message directly the facilitator or a technical support person in case a no chat comments policy is in place).

7. Always include transcripts on your podcasts. Perhaps a compilation of transcripts may be the starting point for an e-book.
8. Recruit trainers and facilitators in your pool of trainers with experience with disability issues and trainers with a disability themselves. Such knowledge can be shared with other trainers and the talent working in your youth organisation.

9. Look for partnerships and training opportunities with organisations specialised on diverse access needs and inclusion, so that the staff in youth organisations can actively identify and remove barriers for people with different types of sensory impairments.

10. Add an inclusion statement in the call for participants to encourage everyone’s participation.

11. Budget for inclusive platforms and adaptations that might be needed and buy them by default.

Attitudinal barriers: it consists of a broader classification of issues that are rooted in the social and cultural fabric of our societies. To improve the overall quality and inclusivity of a digital learning program, we should carefully consider the language and images we are using.

Recommendations:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that:

1. Gender neutral language is a respectful way to communicate with the audience. Avoiding applying the male option by default. Instead of using the word man, try to use person, this will surely better resonate with the participants. When using examples it is important to stay away from gender stereotypes contributing to biases that do not support gender equality. This includes inviting participants to share their pronouns, instead of assuming, even ahead of time during the registration procedure.

2. Make sure all learning content uses plain language, precise words and a clear structure to the benefit of your audience. For that, we recommend the use of short sentences with a direct message. Both text and oral communication can be supported by images, symbols or graphics for a better understanding of the main message or how the information is structured.

3. Make an effort to include a definition of the concepts used in the content of the digital learning activities, as concepts may not be as common knowledge as we think.

4. If applicable, try to provide digital learning content in native languages. Participants will connect differently with the content when it is offered in their native languages.
5. When using images, make sure they are representative of the general population, so that all participants can relate to the images. Also, be aware of social and cultural biases to avoid contributing to the consolidation of prejudices.

From the very early stages of the digital learning project, it is important to invite the contributors of the project to have a discussion subordinated to the topic of inclusion. This will allow them to reflect on the ways they can shape the content, accessibility and dissemination of the digital outputs to cater for a diverse audience. Creating a diverse team and pool of partners is an important first step towards inclusion when creating and implementing digital learning for the benefit of all.

In the annex section a resources list is available for additional information and further resources. In order to deepen the knowledge in the inclusion subject, we would like to highlight the Inscool project website, developed by the British Council (Greece); SCOTDEC (Scotland), Expedition inside culture (Poland), and OBESSU (Belgium). Even though the project is directed to schools, a lot of information can be applied in a digital environment.

**CREATING ENGAGEMENT**

The relevance of creating engagement throughout the different stages of the digital learning development process has been emphasized several times in the collected data.

The analysis of the survey clearly shows that youth organisations need to invest a considerable amount of effort into their dissemination strategies and producing digital learning protocols that promote engagement amongst their participants.

The need for engagement goes beyond the digital learning output stage and extends to the dissemination stage of digital learning opportunities. A solid dissemination strategy needs to be carefully crafted in order to reach the target audience who will benefit from the digital learning programs and hopefully, join the network for future interaction or collaboration with the youth organisation in question.

A digital learning activity can be seen as a one-off action which is limited in time or the starting point that evolves into a communal space where the participants interact and support each other in common projects, disseminating relevant common information and sharing the benefits of being part of a youth network. For the longevity of the digital learning project, it is vital to invest in community platforms where participants can engage, according to their needs and expectations.
We list below some strategies that can be applied to generate commitment to learning.

**Recommendations:**

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that:

- **Designing and implementing digital learning protocol:**
  1. Digital activities have to be short. Online meetings and videos have to be concise and straight to the point. It is very difficult to uphold concentration in a digital environment. Plan short and powerful sessions, even if this means planning more sessions.
  2. For sequential online training sessions or offline content, try to keep a shorter interval between the activities. Smaller sessions, but no long gaps in time between sessions.
  3. Take into consideration what will be most relevant to your audience. This will help selecting content according to the participants' points of view. Get to know the participants and deliver content which matters for them.
  4. Plan the sessions with unexpected and exciting activities like quizzes, polls and fun facts.
  5. For online sessions with facilitators, use icebreakers to welcome participants and energisers to lift the spirits.
  6. Always plan the sessions ahead, including break times.
  7. Apart from the time that learners spend on screen for the activities planned (meetings, watching videos, reading articles and so on), consider if the work plan includes extra screen work (outside the time of the activity itself such as summaries, taking notes, or independent project work). Extra work can heavily contribute to screen fatigue and affect participants’ motivation in partaking activities.
  8. When working with groups (online or offline) keep in mind that smaller groups provide more learning opportunities for all elements of the collective.
  9. We previously mentioned the virtues of gamification. Invest in content that can be delivered in a game format. Gamification can use platforms that support role playing activities like Discord or Gather.town (included in the list of ITC tools). Another way of applying gamification is by using narratives that apply the game principles. The participants embark in a story, in which they play a role, as such they face many difficulties and challenges to reach a final goal. Role playing games, for instance Dungeons & Dragons, can provide a vast array of inspiration. Remember that the game is a strategy for engagement, while the ultimate goal is to take the learner on a journey of knowledge and skill acquisition.
Recruitment of the participants:

1. Research your audience, so that you know what their expectations are.
2. Add a reasonable amount of information in the dissemination strategy about the content, competences and time commitment of an activity. Participants need to make an informed decision in order to be prepared and available to commit to the learning process.
3. Use the dissemination strategy to showcase the ways in which your organisation can support young people beyond a specific digital learning program. Support and networking can be valuable commodities.
4. To disseminate your digital learning activities or programs use the same platforms your target audience uses.
5. Commit to providing certification, validation and recognition of digital acquired learning skills. Here are a few examples in favour of certification, but a more comprehensive argument is listed in the Annex List of resources.
   - Certification Badges (for example: Mozilla Open Badge infrastructure)
   - National standards for validation of acquired skills such as the VAE system from France [http://www.francevae.fr/francevae/](http://www.francevae.fr/francevae/); or the ProfilPASS from Germany [http://www.profilpass-online.de/](http://www.profilpass-online.de/).

Certification of acquired skills can be the cherry on top of the cake that will win over the participants.

6. Consider including the creation of an E-Portfolio amongst the activities of your digital learning protocol. This will allow the learner to use the outputs of the work done in a digital portfolio as evidence of their skill level. The aim is to motivate the learner to engage with meaningful work, which will later be an evidence of the competencies they acquired.

Evaluating the digital learning protocol:

1. Create opportunities for feedback from the participants. This is an opportunity to course correct and adjust the protocol to promote more interaction and engagement based on the participants’ experience.
2. Use feedback at different stages of the protocol, not just at the end.
3. Create ways to gauge the level of engagement. Different tools will require different indicators. When selecting the digital tools or platforms it is fundamental
to evaluate how engagement is assessed (likes, comments, clicks, visualisations, time spent with the content, learner’s survey, trainer’s survey or feedback, etc.)

COMMUNITY BUILDING

When people are drawn to a certain digital learning opportunity, they might be looking for more than just a specific knowledge and skill set. There is a good chance they may be looking for other not so obvious aspects, such as inspiration, motivation, support, getting to know like minded people and so on.

All of those expectations may be granted when taking into account the search for community building in digital learning isolated activities or in multi-layers protocols. Promoting community building in online learning can be beneficial in two distinct ways:

- **The participants point of view:**
  - Young people (but not exclusively) can experience great satisfaction from a sense of belonging: deep down, we all want to fit in.
  - A virtual community can provide many benefits such as motivation and support, especially when participants have projects and interests in common.

- **The youth organisation point of view:**
  - Youth organisations tend to promote a pool of young people to contribute to their activities as volunteers, disseminators and supporters.
  - Digital learning projects can last a long time and gather in a virtual environment several levels of participants in different stages of skill development (ambassadors, multipliers and rookies).

**Recommendations:**

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that young people (but not exclusively) can experience great satisfaction from a sense of belonging. Therefore:

1. Community building can positively impact digital learning activities, as it may increase the engagement, motivation and the fun of it. Sharing is a way to create value, as we learn more both individually and collectively.
2. Working together will allow for the development of interpersonal skills, which are increasingly valuable.
3. Learners can derive great support from a dynamic of learning and exchange within peers. Even when a given digital learning program is over, the participants can remain in a digital platform and derive support for the completion of their learning goals or the execution of a project.

4. A community of learners at different stages of skills development may contribute to a multiplying process that results from teaching others and sharing experiences.

5. Having an active community of young people can be a great dissemination tool for youth organisations.

6. A virtual environment for learning and exchange can be a low maintenance way to integrate learners in youth organisations networks.

7. When selecting which digital platforms to use, keep in mind what tools your target audience has been using. Removing entry barriers by offering community building through digital solutions used first and foremost by the participants is a great way to overcome inertia.

8. Consider what tools your participants are using, what are their preferences, what are their expectations and needs.

9. According to our research, we list here some of the more common digital platforms for remote work: Slack (https://slack.com/); Basecamp (https://basecamp.com)

10. According to our research and survey, some youth organisations are using Discord (https://discord.com), due to its vast possibilities (voice, video, text channels, streaming, etc) and growing popularity among young audiences.

11. When designing the dissemination strategy for a digital education activity or program, make sure you have a fair amount of content to feed the interest of the participants which may have joined your organisation’s social media. Content driven posts are the best approach to generate engagement in your social media channels (that and some cute puppies).

As social creatures, humans long for connection and group belonging, which nowadays is not completely determined by physical context, but evermore on shared interests and experiences with like minded others through the digital domain. Therefore, youth organisations can recruit youth and develop young talents while fostering networks for skills development, local and transnational activism, dissemination of information and intrinsic support.
DIGITAL SAFE SPACE

Even though the digital world is still a relatively new territory, youth organisations must be committed to operate online within the highest levels of transparency and safety.

We shall make a distinction here between the technical aspect of digital safety, which is related to European General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR), and the social aspect, that will contribute to a more reassuring and respectful environment for digital learning.

Let us start by defining GDPR. GDPR is most commonly known as data protection law. Its main purpose is to give individuals (or data subjects) control over their personal data. Data controllers (any third party who has access to personal data) must put in place information systems and procedures that obey the highest privacy standards possible by default. That means that datasets cannot be publicly available and personal information cannot be accessible. To allow sharing of data, data controllers must apply pseudonymization or anonymization to fully protect the personal data. There are only six lawful ways to process personal data:

- Consent
- Contract
- Public task
- Vital interest
- Legitimate interest
- Legal requirement

In the scope of the work that brings us here, we will only focus on consent, as this is most relevant for youth organisations and the development of digital learning. In practical terms, when recruiting participants for a digital learning activity or when promoting a digital learning tool, we must inform them that personal data will be treated with respect, sensitivity and compliance with GDPR law. After informing the potential participants it is required to obtain explicit consent from participants over 18 years old.

A second level of distinction related to the age of the participants will be the catalyst for a different set of practices to be applied in the recruitment procedure, as for underage participants parental consent is required.

Either for underage or over 18 year-old participants it is mandatory by law to clearly disclose if data collection will be executed. Also, it is important to provide information on how the participants can contact the organisation to exert their rights, such as information and access, rectification or erasure of personal data.
Recommendation:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that:

- Technical aspect (GDPR compliance and registration form):

1. Youth organisations should have a data privacy policy, in which they clearly state in plain and simple language their compliance with GDPR regulation.
2. The data privacy policy should also include a contact person (email address), so that participants can exert their rights.
3. Include a registration form in the digital learning protocol so that all participants can be informed about the data collection process and their rights.
4. In the registration form you will be able to provide information and seek prior and explicit consent.
5. In case participants are invited to share personal background information during the application process, clearly state that this is a voluntary choice to self-disclose.
6. It is a good practice to create online registration forms in a way that allows questions to be answered or not, to allow voluntary self-disclosure, instead of forms that cannot be submitted unless all fields are filled.
7. For underage participants the application procedure should include registration form and parental consent.
8. Parental consent should aim to inform the legal guardians about a digital learning opportunity, and clearly inform them on the data protection policy in place.
9. If pictures of the participants will be taken and shared online (website, social media, etc), make sure to include it in the parental consent. Before taking pictures inform what the pictures will be used for and allow participants to turn off the cameras.
10. When selecting the digital infrastructure, take into consideration how this processes personal data, internet cookies and targeted online advertising.
11. Sometimes it is asked in the middle of an activity that participants use certain tools to complete an exercise. Ensure you are using tools that can be accessed through a link without the need to download the app or sign in to have access. Participants should have full control over what they sign in or what tools/apps they download on their PC, laptop or mobile device.
Attitudinal considerations for a safe online experience:

1. Create a code of conduct for the digital environment. Adapt it to each digital learning protocol or online activity.
2. Participants can be invited to co-create the code of conduct for the networking platforms they join.
3. Consider having one participant or a group of participants in charge of evaluating and applying the norms established in the code of conduct and enforcing them in case of violation.
4. Always use registration form as an attempt to understand who is to join the digital learning activity. This should be the standard when underage participants are expected to take part in an activity.
5. For online activities with multiple participants, consider including in the application process or registration form that offensive behaviour exhibited will not be tolerated.
6. Participants should be informed on what steps to take in case of online harassment or cyberbullying, that may occur in the context of the digital learning program or outside of it, but perpetrated by one or more other participants. A contact person within the youth organisation should be designated to deal with this.
7. The contact person in case of harassment and cyberbullying should be committed to respect the complainer’s wishes. Protection and empowerment should go side by side. Listen and let the victim of offensive behaviour be part of the solution.
8. When selecting the online platform that will be used, make sure the facilitator has the power to act swiftly, in case one of the participants acts in an offensive or inappropriate way.
9. Screen sharing privileges can be made available to all participants once the group is established. Screen sharing privileges made available in a meeting with unknown intervenients may cause otherwise preventable issues. The facilitator can allow selected participants to screen share when needed.
10. Consider safeguards to allow for offensive comments to be deleted from the digital platforms hosting your learning education program or any online tools associated with it.
11. When a participant(s) is offended by a comment made by another participant, allow the group to voice their opinion. The participant who made the comment
may have an opportunity to retract what was said and learn from the experience. In this way, the moderator is empowering the participant(s) who faced the offensive comment by withholding a rushed judgment over the person who made the comment.

12. For online activities be sure to inform all participants on the ground rules over verbal intervention. For example, inform the participants how they can ask for the floor in a meeting (raising the hand icon; raising the hand in front of the camera; turning the microphone on; using the chat to enlist the willingness to talk, etc).

13. Revisit the recommendations under the topic of inclusion to make sure positive and respectful language is used at all times.

Building a safe space in the digital environment starts by selecting digital tools that are as ethical as possible. Interactions in the online sphere should be respectful, therefore it is important to clarify the rules and enforce them in case of violation. While it is virtually impossible to maintain an online environment completely devoid of false, harmful or negative content, it is our duty to apply the recommendations and always strike at fostering a safe and thriving learning space in our digital learning protocols.

QUALITY ASSURANCE

Quality assurance is not a final task to evaluate the success of a digital learning protocol. It is a mindset that should be present at different stages of the design, implementation and final phase of the learning project. When evaluating the results, it is important to consider the impact for different stakeholders, namely: young people, the youth organisation(s)’ trainers, and so on.

The first step is to create a quality assurance protocol that will affect the development of the digital learning process from inception. For example, the team designs the structure of the digital learning protocol, but before implementing it, it evaluates it against the needs and expectations of potential participants. This step will ensure that the digital learning offer is aligned with what the target audience is looking for, which in turn can benefit the recruitment process.

Once the activities are launched feedback can still be gathered and applied to adjust the content so it better meets the specific requirements and impressions of actual participants. This may not be the case for approaches based on recorded materials.

Finally, when the time for the last activity arrives, it is the time for a global evaluation. Listed below are some strategies to promote feedback throughout the process:
Recommendations:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol consider this:

1. The use of exploratory surveys or focus group techniques to better understand the needs and expectations of your target audience, by exploring what are their interests, what platforms they are using, how they like to learn, what skills they possess and what skills they hope to further develop.

2. Consider creating communication channels (contact person or email address) so that participants can provide feedback related to the content, accessibility, time commitment and their progression throughout the implementation process of the digital learning protocol. If at any point one participant feels the need to provide feedback or express an individual concern, a proper channel should be available.

3. For activities with a facilitator, include the facilitator’s feedback and suggestions in the analysis.

4. When asking for feedback, always invite participants to openly disclose issues or shortcomings and suggestions for improvement.

5. All quality assurance outputs should be considered a valuable source for improvement. Even if the digital learning activity is over, that information should provide valuable information for the team involved in the development and implementation.

6. Consider a debriefing session with different stakeholders involved in the development and implementation of the digital learning protocol. This way valuable lessons can be learned, shared and applied in future projects.

Quality assurance can be much more than an activity evidence to be submitted to a donor. It can be developed as a valuable tool to gauge the quality of the digital learning protocol, execute corrections if needed and contribute to the professional self-development of the team.
DIGITAL LEARNING APPLICATION ON THE TOPIC OF CIVIC AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

In the last section we have been focusing our efforts on better understanding the intricacies of digital learning. In this section we will move towards a reflection on the key aspects of civic and citizenship education by framing it within the context of digital learning.

Creating digital learning programs or activities oriented towards the promotion of skill development is a paradigm shift. It requires perceiving the learner as the center of the learning experience, playing an active role and engaging with the content, the trainer and other stakeholders. It places a much greater emphasis on interactive and collaborative learning, heavily inspired by tangible realities. The assessment is no longer focused on general results, but on the individual learning experience of a lifelong learner.

In order to promote the development of lifelong learning competences for our learners, we must clarify what are the key skills our digital learning programs should focus on. For that, we will list below the eight key competences for lifelong learning, according to the European reference framework (Commission Staff Working Document, SWD, Proposal for a COUNCIL RECOMMENDATION on Key Competences for LifeLong Learning, 2018).

- Literacy competence
- Languages competence
- Science, technological, engineering and mathematical competence
- Digital competence
- Personal, social and learning competence
- Civic competence
- Entrepreneurship competence
- Cultural awareness and expression competence

How exactly can we promote the acquisition of the competences mentioned above? Competence is a concept that encompasses three distinct variables, namely:

- Knowledge: Facts, figures, ideas, concepts, theories, empirical narratives that provide an understanding of a certain subject.
- Skills: the capacity to operate on the knowledge to produce a result.
Attitudes: a mindset - a certain way to act.

Recommendations:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol keep in mind that:

1. Knowledge alone is not enough. Digital learning protocols must provide an opportunity for theoretical acquisitions and practical application, while creating and implementing projects that can impact their communities. This will create the basis for competences development not just for the present moment but for ongoing self-development.

BRINGING THE HUMAN FACTOR INTO THE DIGITAL ENVIRONMENT

Civic and citizenship education training seeks not only to disseminate knowledge, but also to engage young people in a deeper way. The work done in the field of civic and citizenship education constitutes a path for the consolidation of democratic values and international collaboration. Transmitting values and attitudes can be more effective when the human factor is fully present in the learning process, and this constitutes a challenge in digital learning environments. To mitigate this threat, it is vital to include plenty of opportunities for collaboration, support and network with all stakeholders involved in the learning protocol. The topics on engagement and community building in this output can assist you in doing so.

Youth organisations dedicated to creating digital learning protocols on the field of civic and citizenship education will be resorting to a cross-disciplinary approach potentiated by a consortium of partners specialised in different, yet complementary subjects. As we spoke of inclusion, we mentioned that collaborating with partners with a background in activism for inclusion is an effective strategy to incorporate inclusive practices and attitudes into digital learning programs, to promote self-development for project officers, trainers and participants.

Civic and citizenship education requires approaches aimed at promoting the transmission of a particular set of values and skills. Below are listed the desirable values and skills that we should aim to offer as part of digital learning methodologies:

- Using digital learning to promote civic and citizenship core values and attitudes:
  1. Valuing Human Dignity
  2. Valuing Human Rights
3. Valuing Cultural Diversity
4. Valuing Democracy
5. Valuing Justice and the Rule of Law
6. Valuing Fairness
7. Valuing Equality
8. Respect (for others and self-respect)
9. Responsibility
10. Tolerance

Using digital learning to promote civic and citizenship core skills for action:
1. Autonomous learning
2. Analytical skills
3. Critical thinking
4. Listening skills
5. Observation skills
6. Empathy
7. Adaptability
8. Linguistic and plurilingual skills
9. Communicative skills
10. Conflict resolution
11. Knowledge and critical understanding of the self
12. Knowledge and critical understanding of the world

Recommendations:

When designing, implementing and evaluating a digital learning protocol for civic and citizenship education keep in mind that:

1. When exploring a case study, consider the use of narrative (story telling) as a way to convey the emotional state and values driving action. Go beyond descriptive scenarios and focus on the actors, their goals, values and motivations.
2. Create a digital learning protocol that strengthens bridges of collaboration and connection between the local setting where participants are immersed and the transnational, european level. This will create an international connection and foster a sense of European integration and common belonging in a diverse multi-national, cultural and linguistic space.
3. Design the digital learning activity or protocol for a diverse audience, taking into account that diversity enriches the learning experience, promoting empathy and tolerance.

4. Provide space for experience exchange based on local realities. This is an opportunity to practice communicative skills on one side, and listening skills for the active listeners. It can also be a window for other places, promoting a better understanding of the world around us.

5. In order to have a diverse audience, be sure to develop a dissemination and recruitment strategy which takes diversity into account. Contact other local youth organisations and universities through which you may reach a more vast and diverse audience.

6. To learn is a verb and it requires action. The learner is the center of the learning experience. Digital learning approaches allow the learner to take responsibility for their own learning path, shaping it to their own needs and expectations. Asking a learner to take a leading role in their learning process is a valuable way to incentivise them to practice autonomy, responsibility and empowerment.

7. Project-based learning and collaborative work promotes adaptability and conflict resolution among other skills like communication, observation and listening skills.

By means of conclusion, we would like to invite the reader to visit the annex section where valuable resources can be found. This is composed of two lists, one related to topics presented in the document for a dive on specific subjects, and a second listing valuable digital platforms and tools for designing a digital learning activity or protocol.

As result of our desk research, a third section of the annex contains brief summary descriptions of the ICT characterization of and Covid-19 impact on the countries of the youth organisations in the Europe@home consortium. The summaries hope to provide a quick overview of the digital infrastructure in Belgium, Bulgaria, France, Germany and Malta, according to the Education and Training Monitor 2020. The full report for each country can be found at the respective links.

Finally, a fourth section of the annex includes links to a report of the data gathered from the survey and the reflection board exercise, where all partners contributed with ideas and experiences on high quality digital learning experiences.
Annex

RESOURCES LIST

- **OBESSU’s Inclusionary**
  Multiple tools can be found in topics ranging from team building, facilitation techniques, card games (for inclusion), discussion techniques, welcoming activities, youth participation and reflection on trainer/facilitator competencies.

- **OBESSU’s ENABLE - Guide to inclusive youth activities:**
  OBESSU’s toolkit on inclusive activities for all young people represented an important contribution to the way the topic was developed in this document.

- **OBESSU INSCHOOL PROJECT:**
  Project for physical, cultural and socio-economic diversity in schools. The Inscool project website and resources were developed by the British Council (Greece); SCOTDEC (Scotland), Expedition inside culture (Poland), and OBESSU (Belgium) and funded by the Erasmus + Programme.

- **Digital Citizenship Education (DCE), Council of Europe:** [website](https://www.coe.int)
  The DCE project is part of the longstanding program on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education of the Council of Europe.

ICT TOOL LIST

- **CONFERENCING PLATFORMS:**
  - ZOOM: [https://zoom.us](https://zoom.us)
  - CISCO WEBEX: [https://www.webex.com](https://www.webex.com)
  - CLICK MEETING: [https://clickmeeting.com](https://clickmeeting.com)
  - GO TO MEETING: [https://www.gotomeeting.com](https://www.gotomeeting.com)

TOP TIPS:

1. Using popular platforms will ensure a smoother experience from the users’ point of view.
2. Room size matters.
3. Breakout rooms option.
4. Sound quality matters. Invite all participants to use headphones to reduce background noise.
5. Cloud recording storage should be taken into consideration when subscribing to an account.
6. Ability to join meetings from the phone.
7. Screen sharing option.

**PLATFORM FOR ONLINE COURSES CREATION:**
- LEARN DASH: [https://www.learndash.com](https://www.learndash.com)
- UDEMY: [https://www.udemy.com](https://www.udemy.com)
- TEACHABLE: [https://teachable.com](https://teachable.com)
- XPERIENCIFY: [https://xperiencify.com](https://xperiencify.com)
- THINKIFIC: [https://www.thinkific.com](https://www.thinkific.com)
- EdX: [https://www.edx.org](https://www.edx.org)

**TOP TIPS:**
1. Supported formats (video, PDF, image)
2. Editing features and customization options
3. Price
4. Assessment options (quizzes and exams)
5. Marketing options

**PLATFORMS FOR GAMIFICATION:**
- XPERIENCIFY: [https://xperiencify.com](https://xperiencify.com)
- DISCORD: [https://discord.com](https://discord.com)
- GATHER.TOWN: [https://gather.town](https://gather.town)
- SEpollo: [https://seppo.io/gamification-platform/](https://seppo.io/gamification-platform/)
- BRAINSCAPE: [https://www.brainscape.com](https://www.brainscape.com)
- MINECRAFT EDUCATION EDITION: [https://education.minecaft.net](https://education.minecaft.net)
- PEAR DECK: [https://www.peardeck.com](https://www.peardeck.com)
- KAHOOT: [https://kahoot.com](https://kahoot.com)
- CLASS CRAFT: [https://www.classcraft.com](https://www.classcraft.com)
- QUIZLET: [https://quizlet.com/es](https://quizlet.com/es)
TOP TIPS:

1. Select an approach to gamification (flashcards, role play, quizzes, video games, etc), as that will influence the type of digital tools available to choose from.

 Platform for Community Building / Remote Working:

- DISCORD: https://discord.com
- BASECAMP: https://basecamp.com
- WhatsApp: https://www.whatsapp.com
- SIGNAL: https://signal.org/en/
- TELEGRAM: https://telegram.org

TOP TIPS:

1. Determine the goals of the platform and what use it will have for the participants.
2. If possible, use platforms that are already being used in your youth organisation, instead of introducing new platforms. This way it is possible to create a new nucleus inside a larger network.
3. Consider involving the participants in the selection of the platform for community building, when possible.

CLOSED CAPTIONS:

- GET CAPTION: https://getcaption.co
- REV.COM: https://www.rev.com/caption

TRANSCRIPTIONS AND SUBTITLES:

- HAPPY SCRIBE: https://www.happyscribe.com

SURVEYS:

- TYPEFORM: https://www.typeform.com
- SURVEY MONKEY: https://www.surveymonkey.com
- SO GO SURVEY: https://www.sogosurvey.com
- PRO PROFS: https://www.proprofs.com/survey/
TOP TIPS:

1. Professional templates.
7. Data export (spreadsheet) or more advanced analytics (PROPROFS).
8. Price, if it is an issue consider the free versions or use Google forms.

ICT AND COVID-19 SUMMARY STATUS FROM THE EDUCATION AND TRAINING MONITOR 2020

All information hereby quoted come from the Education and Training Monitor 2020 country analysis reports (EU 27).

BELGIUM: Education and Training Monitor 2020

- **Digital education, both ICT infrastructure and ICT competences level:**
  - Half of 16-19 year-olds report above basic overall digital skills (EU average 57%), but 17% consider they have low skills (EU average 15%).
  - Belgian teachers felt less prepared to use ICT for teaching (27.9%; BEfl 34.5%; BEfr 19.5%; EU-22 37.5%).
  - They also reported the lowest use of ICT for projects or class work (28.9%; BEfl 37.8%; BEfr 18.8%; EU-22 46.9%) (all TALIS2, 2018).
  - Infrastructure and equipment in Belgian schools are slightly better than the EU average, but there are regional differences. Belgian schools are on average slightly more digitally equipped and connected than the EU average (European Commission, 2019a) but with large regional variations.
  - Secondary schools in the Brussels Capital Region have the lowest rate of equipment (13.4 devices/100 students in 2017), followed by Wallonia (16.5), Flanders (41.0) and the German-speaking Community (43.6).
  - The Flemish Community is active on curricular reform, digital equipment, strengthening media literacy and innovative learning environments (Vlaamse Regering 2019, Strategisch Plan Geletterdheid 2017-2014). Each school is encouraged to have a digital strategy. The Media Literacy Concept Note focuses, among other things, on enhancing competences, e-safety and an e-inclusive society.
  - The programme ‘Safe Online’ supports parental involvement in digital education. Digital competences, based on the DigComp framework, are progressively being integrated into the new primary and secondary curricula as cross-curricular attainment goals.
- The private sector is being encouraged to co-invest in innovation in schools.
- Teachers report that they are now more convinced of the usefulness of ICT in education, but this has not translated into increased classroom teaching (Heymans, 2018).
- The school inspection services have recommended improvement of ICT infrastructure and teacher training (Vlaamse overheid, 2020).

Covid-19: Description of the affairs:

The Covid-19 crisis has shown that it is urgent to implement the 2018 digital strategy for education in the French Community. Curricula for pupils up to 15yo and teacher training programmes are being drafted, based on an adaptation of the DigComp framework (Eurydice, 2019). Planned reforms of initial teacher training and curricula are further delayed and will be rolled out gradually, while measures to improve students’ digital competences are not yet in place. ‘Digital Wallonia’ annually supports about 500 digital school projects covering nearly 15% of all schools, linking the allocation of digital equipment to the quality of pedagogical plans and training (Agence du numérique, 2018a). TALIS 2018 data suggest that in BEfr schools digital technology and internet access are among the lowest in the EU. In addition, a comparatively high share of teachers reports a high need for professional development in ICT, with only a low share who feels well prepared to use ICT for teaching (19.5%; EU-22 37.5%).

BULGARIA: Education and Training Monitor 2020

Digital education, both ICT infrastructure and ICT competences level:
- Upper secondary students in highly digitally equipped and connected schools: 31% at lower secondary level (EU average 52%).
- Students ICT level self-evaluation: only 57% of Bulgarians aged 16-19 assessed their digital skills as basic or higher (below the EU average of 82%).
- At upper secondary level, students’ confidence is above the EU average in digital content creation, problem solving and safety, but not in communication and collaboration, information and data literacy (European Commission, 2019a).
- Nevertheless, in Bulgaria there are comparatively more students engaging in coding activities (ibid.).
- In 2019, 73% of tenth grade students who took the compulsory standardised test received a certificate attesting their level of digital competences. The assessment also indicates the areas that require further improvement, including computational thinking, problem solving and creation of digital content.
- Insufficient digital skills among teachers are an obstacle to the use of technology in the classroom. In the 2018 Teaching and Learning International Survey (TALIS), 44% of Bulgarian teachers in lower secondary education reported using ICT in most or every lesson, slightly below the EU average of 47% (OECD, 2019a).
Bulgarian teachers report the lack of technical equipment and appropriate products, lack of skills and time in the curriculum (E. Paunova-Hubenova et al., 2019).

Compared to the EU average, Bulgarian teachers tend to have less confidence in their digital skills (European Commission, 2019a).

These figures partly reflect the large proportion of teachers above 50yo and highlight the need for training on how to integrate technology.

Covid-19: Description of the affairs:

The lack of ICT skills in teaching was also evident during the Covid-19 school closure, with two thirds of respondent teachers in a recent survey reporting no prior training on working with online platforms or distance learning programmes (Bakracheva M., Totseva J., 2020). The programmes ‘Qualification of Pedagogical Specialists’ and ‘Education for tomorrow’, co-funded by the European Social Fund (ESF), have been providing training to teachers in various topics, including digital skills.

Programs to improve ICT infrastructure and competences:

- Efforts are underway to improve the low level of digital skills. The 2020 Digital Economy and Society Index places Bulgaria at the bottom of European rankings based on the level of digital skills of adults, young people and ICT specialists. Nevertheless, in recent years there has been an increased focus on improving digital skills and digital education. To this end, several EU-funded projects and national programmes aim to upgrade the skills of teachers and students, improve schools’ digital infrastructure and strengthen cooperation between the IT sector and Vocational Education and Training (VET) schools. An increasing number of schools are receiving support to apply innovative teaching methods based on digital technologies and gaming. Thirty percent of Bulgarian schools have already used the ‘SELFIE’ tool to assess how well they use digital technologies in teaching and learning. Coding is offered as a subject starting from third grade, and the number of upper secondary classes specialising in ICT has increased, while four universities offer programmes in artificial intelligence. Although the measures have not entirely kept pace with the scale of the digital transformation (European Commission, 2019b), these efforts may help improve the acquisition of digital skills, which have become of critical importance in the new realities of Covid-19. In this context, in 2020 the Council of the European Union adopted a country-specific recommendation calling on Bulgaria to ‘promote digital skills and equal access to education’ (Council of the European Union, 2020).

- Digital Bulgaria 2025: an ambitious modernising program for the widespread adoption of intelligent IT solutions in all areas of the economy and life.

- Education for tomorrow: this project aims to boost digital technologies by creating a platform for educational services and digital content. This would improve the process of digitalisation in education, facilitate communication between teachers and parents and
provide opportunities for better individualised teaching and learning approaches, as well as encouraging self-study and self-assessment. https://oud.mon.bg/.

FRANCE: Education and Training Monitor 2020

- Digital education, both ICT infrastructure and ICT competences level:
  - More 16-19 year-olds reported having above basic overall digital skills in 2019: 62% compared to 57% in 2015, close to the average trend in the EU (57% and 52%, respectively).
  - National data on digital skills competences are not yet available.
  - There is evidence of a digital divide by gender and pupils’ socioeconomic status: girls outperform boys in CIL (24 points) across all achievement levels, as was the case in all participating EU countries. Male underachievers particularly outnumbered females (49.2% v 37.8%). Socioeconomic background, migrant status and language spoken at home seemed to influence pupil achievement, echoing the pattern in the OECD Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) results (see below). French students also scored at the EU average on computational thinking (CT), where boys performed better than girls, but this result was not statistically significant. The ICILS study also shows that CIL and CT are well covered in the national curriculum.
  - Highly digitalised schools: lower secondary was in line with the EU average, and higher secondary level was above it (81% v 72%).
  - The share of high-speed internet connectivity at all education levels is still lower than the EU average (European Commission, 2019a).
  - The Court of Auditors (2019) recommended that future investments should be better linked to teacher training, innovative pedagogies, new pilot projects and use of artificial intelligence (AI) for education.

- Covid-19: Description of the affairs:

Distance learning during the Covid-19 crisis has likely increased gaps in educational outcomes. It is estimated that 6% of pupils in primary education and 10% in secondary education became disengaged from studying (DEPP, 2020a). Schools reopened on May 18 to mitigate school dropout and socioeconomic inequalities. Measures taken during the closures included: providing digital equipment to vulnerable pupils; mentoring and tutoring through voluntary networks and the redeployment of 25,000 volunteers from the Civic Service; an online platform (Je veux aider); and additional funding to local associations (OECD, 2020a).
GERMANY: Education and Training Monitor 2020

- **Digital education both ICT infrastructure and ICT competences level:**
  - Upper secondary students with access to digital equipment and connectivity: 48% / 26pps behind the EU average.
  - ¾ of German students have access to digital learning resources: the content is 64% offline and 73% online.
  - German students with no access to school internet: 9% have no access to school internet.
  - The share of digitally supportive schools is low: at primary, lower secondary and upper secondary level, only 5%, 28% and 23% report a strong information and communications technology (ICT) policy and strong ICT support, compared to the respective EU averages of 20%, 33% and 51%.
  - Students have above average ICT skills.
  - The share of students achieving at least basic computational thinking (CT) knowledge (level 2) in ICILS 2018 is at 67%.
  - There are differences in knowledge linked to students’ socio-economic and migrant background, in particular for those whose home language is not German.
  - German teachers lag behind in ICT skills and in using ICT during lessons (only 20% report using ICT in daily teaching) but are comfortable using it to prepare lessons.

- **Covid-19: Description of the affairs:**

Schools shifted to distance learning during the Covid-19 crisis, but with some major weaknesses. Schools were closed from mid-March and started to partially reopen at the end of April. Schools successfully moved to distance learning. The majority of students could cope well, but half considered it difficult and about 10% lost all contact with their teachers and peers. Nearly all missed their friends and school life. Teachers found the transition difficult initially: only a third of schools were well prepared (Vodafone, 2020b). All regions created or strengthened platforms facilitating access to teaching and learning tools and for communication, yet only 35% of teachers managed to have very regular contact with all their students and about 10% had very little or none, which meant an important loss also in social contact. Parental support was crucial during homeschooling, but 43% of parents reported having not enough time (Vodafone, 2020a). A big concern is that distance learning might have increased already existing inequalities: regions are implementing a variety of measures, including summer camps, to prevent this from happening. A EUR 500 million 2-year emergency programme agreed on 15 May will allow regions to acquire mobile devices to be lent to students who need one. The government and regions agreed to speed up implementation of the Digital Pact (without effect yet), and to allow its funds to be used
during 2020 also for learning and teaching material (EUR 100 million) alongside hardware. Teacher associations in Early Childhood Education and Care (ECEC) and in schools have proposed concepts for the use of blended learning in schools. All school leaving exams have been conducted as normal, allowing access to continued education.

MALTA: Education and Training Monitor

- **Digital education, both ICT infrastructure and ICT competences level:**
  - A comparatively high proportion of young people possess above basic digital skills. 74% of those aged 16-19 report having above-basic overall digital skills in 2017 (EU-27: 57%).
  - However, students at secondary level report lower levels of confidence in their digital competences as defined in the DigComp framework2, compared to the EU average. Furthermore, in line with most Member States, more than half of secondary students can be defined as ‘less digitally active with a rather moderate level of support’, which means they have poor access to digital technologies at home, at school or outside school, engage less frequently in digital activities during lessons or outside school, and evaluate the impact of ICT use during lessons less positively. This is particularly the case at upper secondary level, where ICT is taught as one of the applied subjects following the reform of the secondary school system, and teachers tend to use digital devices less often during lessons than in the other, lower, levels of education (European Commission 2019a).
  - Schools and pupils are comparatively well equipped with ICT tools, and additional support was provided to disadvantaged pupils during the Covid-19 crisis.
  - Maltese pupils attend schools which are among the most digitally equipped in the EU, in particular at primary level (82% v 35% at EU level).
  - This is mainly the consequence of the project ‘One Tablet Per Child’, which provided tablets at primary level with the European Social Fund support. This has also been very effective in enabling the switch to online learning during the Covid-19 outbreak, making for a smoother transition for pupils in the last three years of primary.
  - However, according to school principals, there is a large socio-economic gap in access to ICT: a smaller proportion of pupils in disadvantaged schools have digital devices connected to the internet (46% v 82% in advantaged schools) and they have poorer computing capacity (Reimers and Schleicher 2020 and OECD, PISA 2018 database).
  - In Malta, high investment in digital equipment is accompanied by short teacher training courses covering the pedagogical use of ICT in teaching and learning, with IT support teachers who assist teachers with technical aspects. This has helped Maltese teachers to gain a higher level of confidence in their digital competences compared to the EU average (OECD 2019a). However, according to school principals, teachers tend to be less prepared and have less access to professional development opportunities on using digital devices in socio-economically disadvantaged schools than they do in advantaged schools (Reimers and Schleicher 2020).
Covid-19: Description of the affairs:

During the Covid-19 lockdown, free internet and computers have been distributed to disadvantaged children to allow them to continue their studies at home. An online platform with free educational contents was made available to parents and students in April. Parents could also opt for up to 40 sessions on online learning offered by the Institute for Education, while support for teachers was provided mainly in the form of educational resources, initially through the Ministry’s official website. These two platforms have mostly allowed for the communication of tasks such as homework.
EUROPE@HOME_OUTPUT 1

In order to better understand how digital learning has been elaborated and presented to the youth public, in the scope of the Output 1, we designed a triad approach to data collection and analysis, which integrates a state of the art, followed by a survey oriented toward youth organisations with online learning experience and a reflection board where the partners (& friends) gather some thoughts, impressions and experiences about online learning.

At this point we will reveal the main inputs gathered from our survey, which was available throughout February 2021.

We would like to express our gratitude for the generous contribution of all participants in the survey. Thank you!

MAIN QUESTION:
How youth organisations are developing and implementing online learning activities or programs?

THE RESPONDENTS/SURVEEES:
31 surveys in total
- 36 NGOs
- 1 University
- 9 Different countries within Europe

SURVEY’S STRUCTURE:
- General description of the online activity / program
- Motivations
- Digital infrastructure used
- Target group
- Online safety
- Data protection
- Online engagement
- Opportunities of the digital approach
- Limitations (observed during the implementation of the online activity/program)
- Second set of questions related to civic/citizenship education, if applicable.

Date of the report: 1st March 2021

LET’S DIG IN:
1. 3 main motivations identified
   - Direct result of covid-19: 3/4 of the participants claim that covid-19 was the main motivation to put in place an online activity or a learning program.
   - Reach a bigger audience: Be able to go beyond the physical limitations of your geography and expand your audience
   - Digitalization is the future: Firm believe that digitalization and innovation are a must in the youth sector.

   1.1 Selected style of interaction with participants
   - Fully virtual: like a video a MOOC where the participant doesn’t interact with anyone else. This approach to online learning was based on videos (on YouTube or Instagram), MOOC, articles (on Wordpress), or Podcasts which were made available to the participants.
   - Mediated approach: in this case a trainer or facilitator will interact with the participants, and participants interact with each other. This was a very common approach, that encompasses online meetings (Zoom, google meets, big blue button, microsoft teams).
   - Mixed protocol: a mixed of online activities with interaction and other activities where the participants access the content by themselves (videos or articles). This was the most popular approach, where meetings and webinars were complemented by other written, auditory or visual supports.
DIGITAL INFRASTRUCTURE:

- Videos
  - Loom: For video messaging, https://www.loom.com
  - Wonder.me: For fun and interactive events, https://www.wonder.me
  - Kahoot: Platform for gamification, https://kahoot.it

- Written content
  - Padlet: https://padlet.com
  - Concept board: https://conceptboard.com
  - Mentimeter: https://www.mentimeter.com

- Microsoft Teams

AVANT GARD PLATFORMS

- WHITE BOARD
- DISCORD
- Senaryon: Platform for gamification
  - https://games.senaryon.de/login

- AVANT GARD PLATFORMS

- AVANT GARD PLATFORMS

CRITERIA USED WHEN CHOOSING THE DIGITAL TOOLS:

- User friendly for participants and facilitators
- Cost
- Compatible to mainstream software / hardware
- Internet usage
- Allow community building
- Promote engagement

ONLINE SAFETY AND DATA PROTECTION:

1. Specific protocol to ensure online safety and data protection

- Parental consent: for underage participants.
- Data protection: follow GDPR regulation, creation of a data protection declaration or form.
- Confidentiality.
- Development of a code of conduct online.
- Creation of a safe space for participants.
- Online bullying: Self-unmute was not allowed, private chat not available, no commenting on the shared presentation, password protected.
- Setting out rules and expectations in advance: as an introduction to the activity, or the use of a declaration or form that participants have to sign.
- Selection of software that guarantees data protection.

TARGET GROUP OF OUR SURVEYEE:

- Students
- Teachers
- Young professionals
- Other NGO’s
- Families
BIBLIOGRAPHY


- Decision (EU 2018/646) of the European Parliament and of the Council on a common framework for the provision of better services for skills and qualifications (EUROPASS).

- Resolutions European Parliament (13.11.2020): Education in the digital era: Challenges, opportunities and lessons for EU policy design.

- COM (2018/ 268): Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the European Council, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions - Building a stronger Europe: the role of youth, education and culture policies.

- Education and training monitor 2020, European Commission